

China Shaping the Operational Environment
A Disciple on the Path of Deception and Influence

by

Scott J. Henderson

November 2011

Disclaimer

The views expressed in this report are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the official policy or position of the Department of the Army, Department of Defense, or the U.S. government.

The Foreign Military Studies Office (FMSO) assesses regional military and security issues through open-source media and direct engagement with foreign military and security specialists to advise army leadership on issues of policy and planning critical to the U.S. Army and the wider military community.

China Shaping the Operational Environment

A Disciple on the Path of Deception and Influence

In trying to convey the importance of China's internally produced military writings, it is tempting to quote Sun-Tzu's famous line, "If you know your enemy and know yourself, in one hundred battles, you will never know peril." However, this same lesson is perhaps better illustrated in the movie *Patton*, as the general outmaneuvers German forces and shouts, "Rommel, you magnificent bastard, I read your book!" Clearly, a deeper understanding of Chinese strategy and theory is essential and familiarity with Chinese military writings a must if we are to understand the People's Liberation Army. Relying on bibliometric research and subject matter content, this report will attempt to spotlight important trends in the evolution of Chinese military thought from one of its most influential publications on strategy and theory, *China Military Science*. This report will also attempt to ascertain if the writings are historical, contemporary or predictive in nature.

In 2008, a team of researchers from the Academy of Military Science performed a bibliometric survey on *China Military Science* focusing on the ten-year period from 1997-2006.¹ Bibliometric research utilizes quantitative analysis and statistics to describe patterns of publication within a given field or body of literature.² The authors of the study, Luo Jiancheng, Zheng Yi, and Chen Haoliang noted that there is considerable difference between the study and application of bibliometrics carried out by information management workers involved with military affairs and those of civilian scholars. They further noted that few monographs or papers have been produced using bibliographic methods to study information management in military affairs. The authors divided their paper into four primary sections and presented their statistical results in seven tables:

- I. The Significance of Choosing this Publication as the Source for Statistics
- II. Methods of Statistical Analysis
- III. Statistical Results
 - a. Statistics for Papers Carried in the Publication
 - b. Statistics for the Number of Papers Published by Author
 - c. Statistics for the Distribution of Topics
 - d. Statistics for the Group of Core Authors
 - e. Statistics for the Unit Distribution of the Authors
 - f. Statistics for the Author's ranks
 - g. Statistics for the Authors' Special Technical Duties
- IV. Analysis and Evaluation

¹ Luo Jiancheng, Zheng Yi, Chen Haoliang, "Statistics and Analysis of the Essays in *China Military Science* (1998-2007)," *China Military Science* No. 1, 2008, p. 149-156

Authors: Luo Jiancheng, librarian, Academy of Military Science Military Library Archives; Zheng Yi, assistant research librarian, Academy of Military Science Military Library Archives; Chen Haoliang, assistant research librarian, Academy of Military Science Archives

² Definition supplied by the University of Texas:

<http://www.ischool.utexas.edu/~palmquis/courses/biblio.html>

While each section is enlightening, offering us a glimpse into Chinese military thought, they fail to provide us with an understanding of evolving trends in the subject matter under discussion. To supplement the Chinese bibliometric study, this paper reexamined the years 2002-2008 and broke them down by topic. This differs from the Chinese methodology in that it examines title content to determine trends in Chinese military thinking. *China Military Science* generally arranges each issue under the following six broad topic areas:

- (1) *Subject Discussion*
- (2) *Applied Study*
- (3) *Basic Study*
- (4) *Military History*
- (5) *Academic*
- (6) *Book Review*

Due to similarity, the categories “Academic” and “Book Review” were combined. The broader topics, based on content, were broken down into subtopics, giving the reader a better understanding of the trends in Chinese military theory.

Chinese Bibliometric Survey and Methodology

I. The Significance of Choosing this Publication as the Source for Statistics

The Chinese authors, who conducted the bibliometric research on *China Military Science*, state that the publication was chosen for its influential nature on comprehensive military theory inside China. First appearing in 1988, *China Military Science* was sponsored by the China Association for Military Science and the People’s Liberation Army Academy of Military Science. The journal is considered one of the most prestigious publications of its kind and is credited in playing a decisive role in influencing military thought. Viewed as a core journal and key academic periodical, *China Military Science* has received numerous national awards for journalism and been cited for its outstanding quality. The authors of the study chose the ten-year period from 1997-2006 to perform their research and analysis.³

II. Methods of Statistical Analysis

In order to ensure statistical accuracy, the Chinese researchers opted to use computer-assisted methods for compiling the information. Human analysis was then performed to confirm the computer generated results. While excited by this undertaking, the authors pointed out that computer-based bibliometric research for military affairs was still experimental and needed further improvements and standardization.⁴

³ Luo Jiancheng, Zheng Yi, Chen Haoliang, “Statistics and Analysis of the Essays in *China Military Science* (1998-2007),” *China Military Science* No. 1, 2008, p. 149-156

⁴ Ibid

III. Statistical Results

a. Statistics for Papers Carried in the Publication

The Chinese research team first carried out statistical analysis to establish the publication's overall ability to transmit information, a key index associated with core periodicals. The first step was to determine information density, which is the amount of data carried, measured against the ratio of pages. For the ten-year period covered, the journal published 54 editions, containing 1,176 papers. This came out to approximately 22 articles per issue, averaging around seven pages in length. Information density dropped after the first three years of publication from 0.16 to 0.14, when *China Military Science* switched from a quarterly to a bimonthly publication.⁵

Table 1: Statistics for the Papers Carried in the Publication

year	number of issues	number of papers carried	average number of papers carried per issue	number of pages	average number of pages per paper	information density
1997	4	98	24.5	631	6.4	0.16
1998	4	110	27.5	715	6.5	0.15
1999	4	101	25.3	628	6.2	0.16
2000	6	125	20.8	949	7.6	0.13
2001	6	127	21.1	919	7.2	0.14
2002	6	122	20.3	920	7.5	0.13
2003	6	124	20.6	921	7.4	0.14
2004	6	122	20.3	898	7.4	0.14
2005	6	125	20.8	904	7.2	0.14
2006	6	122	20.3	897	7.4	0.14
total	54	1,176	22.2	8,382	7.1	0.14

b. Statistics for the Number of Papers Published by Author

Cited as a key index for measuring an academic periodical's ability to collect and transmit information, the research team of Luo Jiancheng, Zheng Yi, and Chen Haoliang compiled the number of papers published by individual and collective authors⁶ in *China Military Science*. However, the statistics for 11 collective authors were eliminated from the table for convenience of analysis. Over the ten-year period, there were a total of 1,585 individual authors and 11 collective authors. Those defined as core authors published 1,176 papers, and the average number of papers published for each author was 0.75.⁷

⁵ Ibid

⁶ The term collective author appears to be interchangeable with co-author.

⁷ Ibid

Table 2: Statistics for the Number of Papers Published by the Authors

year	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2000	2003	2004	2005	2006	total
number of authors	119	140	129	166	175	164	168	175	168	170	1,574
number of papers	98	110	101	125	127	122	124	122	125	122	1,176
number of papers per person	0.82	0.79	0.78	0.75	0.73	0.74	0.74	0.70	0.74	0.72	0.75

c. Statistics for the Distribution of Topics

The first category, labeled *forum topics*, focused on central military theories. The second category, labeled *key research*, examined basic and application questions as they pertained to military theories and reflected the latest research results in all disciplines of military science. The third category, labeled *short columns*, centered on academics and research summaries.⁸

The Chinese results will be presented first, followed by the supplemental research material with a brief analysis of the individual years. A more comprehensive narrative of the overall trend will be provided in the conclusions. There is also substantial difference between the way the Chinese categorized the individual topics and that of the supplemental analysis. There are a number of reasons for this disparity but most prominent is the subjective nature of the articles themselves. Here are just a few examples of the difficulty in dividing the groups:

Year/Subject	Category
2002 Asia-Pacific security strategy	Geo-politics or Strategy
2003 Mobilization of National Economy	Mobilization or Economy
2003 <i>Art of War</i> information	Sun Tzu or Informationization
2004 Strategic psychological warfare	Strategy or psychological warfare
2005 Mobilization in Information warfare	Mobilization or Information warfare
2008 Information Law	Information or Legal

In order to spot major trends in Chinese military thinking, generic topics that failed to provide insight into the nature of the article were dropped to prevent clutter.

⁸ Ibid

Table 3: Statistics for the Distribution of Topics Selected for the Papers that Were Carried

section	topics selected	number of papers published
section 1: topic forums	strategic and thought culture	15
	discussions of the matter of China's military modernization	6
	Chinese government exercising sovereignty after the return of Hong Kong, and the Chinese People's Liberation Army being garrisoned in Hong Kong	5
	studies on the ocean and China's maritime defense	8
	the Party's group of third-generation leaders and quality building in the armed forces	21
	studying Deng Xiaoping military thought and enhancing quality building in the armed forces	9
	China's military thought and China's historic cultural traditions	8
	discussions of the historical development of China's geostrategic thought and the characteristics of theory	8
	strategic thought and culture	15
	research into realizing China's military law and historic problems	8
	China's military sociology and armed forces building in the new era	9
	studying Deng Xiaoping theory and exploring the characteristics and laws for administering the military in the new circumstances	32
	exploring theories for strategy and campaign guidance for high-technology limited wars	8
	strategic orientation of the Kosovo War and NATO	7
	Sun Zi's Art of War and modern international security	7
	reflections after the Kosovo War	3
	monographs commemorating the 50th anniversary of the founding of the People's Republic of China	6
	Chinese government exercising sovereignty after the return of Macau, and the Chinese People's Liberation Army being garrisoned in Macau	4
	study of strategic theories for the great endeavor of the reunification of the motherland	32
	study of 100 years of military affairs	16
	the post-Cold War world geostrategic evolution and China's geostrategy	6
	comparative study of Chinese and foreign military thought	5
	brilliant writings -- monumental works of history (commemorating the 50th anniversary of the Chinese People's Volunteer Army going abroad for the War to Resist US Aggression and Aid Korea)	5

study of Chinese military culture	6
new writings on the study of military science in Sun Zi at the opening of the 21st century	7
revolution and development in armed forces logistics in the new era	9
opening up the West and national security	7
the social and cultural origins of foreign military policy	6
developing the study of China's modern military and strategic theory	8
space strategy and national security	6
historic military debates that have had major impact on national security	10
study of China's military culture theory	27
innovation and development of theories for guiding Marxist military science	23
new developments in modern war supremacy theory	6
study of China's border theory and practice	6
revelations from the Iraq War	5
carrying forward and developing the theories guiding modern Chinese military science	16
carrying forward and developing Mao Zedong military thought	24
commemorating the 100th anniversary of Deng Xiaoping's birth	4
study of strategic psychological warfare theory	11
study of informatized warfare theory	6
study of Sun Zi's Art of War facing the world and facing the future	14
discussions of matters concerning war theory in the new century	10
general reflections on informatization building of the armed forces	6
study of theories for building a system of laws for military affairs	6
booming development of Marxist military theory	5
commemorating the 60th anniversary of victory in the Chinese People's War of Resistance Against Japan	7
study of fighting spirit theory	6
using a scientific development approach to command national defense and military building	51
carrying out the historic mission of the new century and the new era and promoting military modernization building	4
innovation and development of military science thought	5
study of integrated air-space warfare theory	4
study of geostrategic theory	4
Sun Zi's Art of War, peaceful development, warfare control	7

	the strategic guidance of past dynasties for realizing unification of the country	5
section 2: key research	applied research	138
	fundamental research	119
	comprehensive research	112
	examination of military history	76
	world military affairs	17
	foreign military research	14
	management of scientific research	2
	reviews of foreign military affairs	12
	academician essays	3
	research on special topics	3
	international military affairs	2
section 3: short columns	arguments and strategic decisions of the US, the Soviet Union, and Japan concerning strategic and military matters	4
	academic frontiers	20
	academic contention	32
	research summaries	21
	English manuscripts	8
	military commentaries	7
	doctoral compositions/essays	14
	special reports in English	3
	special recommendations	2
	graduate student corner	2
	monographs from this publication	1
	77 special topics	1,176 essays

Supplemental Statistic: The following section is independent of the Chinese bibliometric survey and performed by the author of this paper. First there will be a brief discussion of the year and surrounding events that possibly influenced the topics of that time period and then a presentation of the subjects covered.

To compile the supplemental data, all articles that appeared in the 46 issues of *China Military Science* from 2002-2008 were placed into five major categories: subject discussion, applied study, basic study, military history and academic review. An abbreviated topic line has been used to highlight the primary theme of each article. Finally, individual years were reviewed side-by-side and analyzed to determine if a chronological narrative developed over the seven-year period.

China Military Science 2002 **Informationization, Strategy and Chinese Military Culture**

Still unnerved by the effects of the 1990 Gulf War and observing the start of operations in Afghanistan, force modernization was a top priority for the People's Liberation Army in 2002. Precision weapons and the effects of high-tech equipment on the battlefield left the Chinese with little doubt that transformation was in order. Force transition not only dominates the year 2002, but remained a focal point for years to come.

China's periphery shares common borders and adjacent waters with eighteen different countries. From 1931-1988, the People's Republic of China engaged in major hostilities or skirmishes with six of these neighbors. Indeed, even today, China has few neighbors with which it does not have some major unresolved border or sea issue. A few examples of potential border/sea issues that could spark future conflicts are: border demarcations, drug trafficking, influx of illegal arms, insurgent infiltration, fresh-water rights, ocean-held hydrocarbons, and traverse of sea lanes. In 2002, these concerns were reflected in *China Military Science* as it took special interest in peripheral defense to include: space, maritime, and active defense.

While China is one of the oldest civilizations on earth, its current military system, in the form of the People's Liberation Army, is relatively young. Founded in 1927 and torn apart by civil war until the establishment of the PRC in 1949, the People's Liberation Army's emphasis on defining Chinese military culture is easy to understand. Their lack of firmly established military traditions, coupled with modernization and the recruitment of better educated soldiers, who do not necessarily hold the same party loyalty as their elders, is a cause for great concern. Beijing is determined to build a high-tech, modern fighting force, but not at the expense of transitioning from a party to a nationalist army.

- Developing issues: Space warfare, Information warfare, Psychological warfare, and Network warfare

Subject Discussion 2002

- 1) Space strategy
- 2) National security in Chinese history
- 3) Study of Chinese military culture
- 4) Chinese military culture
- 5) Marxist theory of military scientific guidance
- 6) Chinese military culture
- 7) Chinese military culture

Applied Study 2002

- 1) Maritime strategy
- 2) Information warfare
- 3) Psychological warfare
- 4) Reform officer policy
- 5) Precise warfare
- 6) Operational capabilities
- 7) Propaganda
- 8) Population growth impact
- 9) Military reform
- 10) Taiwan
- 11) Weaponry

- 12) Hi-tech warfare
- 13) Military news coverage
- 14) Informationization
- 15) Network warfare

Basic Study 2002

- 1) Security strategy
- 2) Active defense strategy
- 3) Military culture
- 4) Democracy of the People's Liberation Army
- 5) Revolution in military affairs
- 6) Psychological warfare
- 7) Marx and Engels
- 8) Asymmetric strategy
- 9) Military Encyclopedia
- 10) Air and sea domination
- 11) Mastery of traffic
- 12) Information warfare
- 13) Hi-tech and laws of war

Military History 2002

- 1) General Liu Yalou on the People's Liberation Air Force development
- 2) Post-war evolution of international strategic patterns
- 3) Ancient Chinese government's administration of Western frontiers
- 4) Su Yu's military command art
- 5) Experience of the People's Liberation Army growth during the war years
- 6) Historical review of the People's Liberation Army physical education training
- 7) War outlook in the early Qin Dynasty era
- 8) Study of Cai E's military legal system
- 9) *Art of War*

Academic/Book Review 2002

- 1) Guiding ideology and development of the People's Liberation Army
- 2) Military Law
- 3) War of resistance against Japan
- 4) Scientific exploration and accumulated theory
- 5) Asia-Pacific security strategy
- 6) Domination of information and traffic
- 7) State security
- 8) Creative development of the People's Liberation Army
- 9) Jiang Zimin on the "The Three Represents"
- 10) Library dissertations and works in Chinese military

China Military Science 2003 **Informationization, Strategy, Economics**

The start of the Iraq War in 2003 would once again shine an unfavorable light on the high-tech shortcomings of the People's Liberation Army. In the initial stages of the Iraq War, the US military was able to project force half-way around the globe and defeat one of the world's largest standing armies in just under a month; a feat the Chinese could not hope to duplicate. The drive to build an informationized military continued unabated and oriented on defensive measures.

The strategic focus of 2003 appears to center on the theory of war forms and strategy with Chinese characteristics. Many of these topics will be combined in the 2005 edition of The Science of Military Strategy, a comprehensive book on Chinese strategic structure published by *Military Science* (People's Liberation Army, academic wing).

Economic construction is the engine of military modernization and the Chinese understand you cannot have one without the other. Moreover, Beijing is aware that this is not a chicken or egg scenario – economics comes first. The White Paper on *China's National Defense in 2008* sums up their thinking on economic mobilization: “The mobilization of the national economy refers to activities which improve, in a planned and organized way, the emergency reaction capabilities of national economy for national security. In peacetime, as an important measure to build up the economic potentials for national defense and to cope with contingencies, the mobilization of national economy balances the proportion of the permanent power of the defense economy to the national economy, and constitutes a powerful deterrence to war.”⁹

- Developing issues: *Art of War* and Ancient Chinese Strategies

Subject Discussion 2003

- 1) Enlightenment from the Iraq War
- 2) Marxist military science
- 3) Mao Zedong military thought
- 4) Marxist theory of military science
- 5) China's frontier defense
- 6) Theory of dominance in modern war

Applied Study 2003

- 1) Informationized warfare trends
- 2) Information construction
- 3) Information operations in joint campaigns
- 4) Chinese military strategy in the 21st Century
- 5) Breakthrough in naval modernization

⁹ *China's National Defense in 2008* downloaded from <http://www.china.org.cn/e-white/>

- 6) Ideological and cultural development
- 7) Logistics construction
- 8) Informationization
- 9) Revolution in military affairs
- 10) Jungle warfare
- 11) Postgraduate education
- 12) Logistics
- 13) Military reform
- 14) Informationization
- 15) Mobilization of national economy
- 16) The “Three Represents”
- 17) Mechanization and Informationization
- 18) The “Two Transitions”
- 19) National defense and economics construction
- 20) Reconsideration of antiaircraft artillery for territorial defense
- 21) Mobilization for national defense
- 22) Logistics
- 23) Strategic thinking
- 24) Revolution in military affairs
- 25) Economic mobilization
- 26) Military training for new talent

Basic Study 2003

- 1) Dominant theory
- 2) Contemporary war, violent nature
- 3) *Art of War* information
- 4) Mao
- 5) Legal system
- 6) War form
- 7) Developments in military affairs
- 8) Military encyclopedia
- 9) Military history
- 10) Hi-tech warfare
- 11) Informationization
- 12) Military strategy
- 13) Space strength
- 14) Stand-off operations
- 15) Mobilization
- 16) Strategy
- 17) Army law
- 18) Military culture

Military History 2003

- 1) Stabilizing the peripheries during the Sui and Tang Dynasties

- 2) Middle East: War and Oil
- 3) Retrospect state grand strategy
- 4) Peasant uprising in land revolution
- 5) Commanding troops by Confucianism
- 6) Why ancient China failed to complete the revolution in gun powder
- 7) Experience in strengthening national defense and economic construction
- 8) Political work in the 1920s

Academic/Book Review 2003

- 1) Sailing the waters of the *Art of War*
- 2) Space domination
- 3) Outline of Chinese military thought
- 4) Chinese ancient strategies
- 5) Study of Deng Xiaoping's theories

China Military Science 2004
Information Warfare, War Theory/Forms, Future War

The year 2004 suggests a slight shift in thinking from pure modernization to implementation of information warfare. No longer are the Chinese concerned with just digitizing the force. Thoughts move toward the correct application of information power. How to mobilize, command, and protect against information power in war under high-tech conditions are all subjects under discussion.

As with the shift in informationization from modernization to implementation, strategy is being applied to the operational environment. What will a modern-day battlefield look like and what are the tools required to fight and win, or possibly not fight and win? Still defensive in nature, Chinese military thinking seeks to level the playing field with “leap-ahead” development.

Media, psychological, and legal warfare are combined as a topic of discussion in 2004. The book Unrestricted Warfare defines these terms as: media warfare, (manipulating what people see and hear in order to lead public opinion along); psychological warfare, (spreading rumors to intimidate the enemy and break down his will); and international law warfare, (seizing the earliest opportunity to set up regulations).¹⁰

- Developing issues: Information, psychological, and legal warfare combined with ancient strategies

¹⁰ Qiao Liang and Wang Xiangsui, Unrestricted Warfare, PLA Literature and Arts Publishing House, 1999, p. 55, as downloaded from <http://www.c4i.org/unrestricted.pdf>

Subject Discussion 2004

- 1) Theoretical study of information warfare
- 2) Mao Zedong military thought
- 3) Theory of Marxist military science
- 4) Contemporary Chinese military science
- 5) Sun Tzu's *Art of War* facing the world and future
- 6) Deng Xiaoping
- 7) Strategic psychological warfare

Applied Study 2004

- 1) Geo-strategy of Chinese Navy
- 2) Integrated operations
- 3) Media warfare, psychological warfare and law warfare
- 4) Development of weapons and equipment
- 5) Information mobilization
- 6) Emancipating the mind and creating a new military theory
- 7) Military culture
- 8) Political work
- 9) Strategy of leap-frog development
- 10) Defense mobilization
- 11) Operations command under informationized conditions
- 12) Leap-ahead development of national defense
- 13) Pushing forward informationization of the People's Liberation Army
- 14) Adapting to the change in war forms
- 15) Defeating the powerful enemy with a weak force
- 16) Political work regulations
- 17) A system of systems
- 18) International security in the new century
- 19) Military affairs with Chinese characteristics
- 20) Leap-Ahead development of the People's Liberation Army modernization
- 21) Leap-Ahead development of the People's Liberation Army weapons and equipment
- 22) Philosophical thinking on innovation in military theory
- 23) Transformation of education in military colleges and schools
- 24) Military creative system
- 25) Army logistics management
- 26) Chinese army's income system

Basic Study 2004

- 1) Deng Xiaoping
- 2) Law of war
- 3) Western ethics of war
- 4) Military theory

- 5) Strategy
- 6) Revolution in military affairs
- 7) Military cognition
- 8) Strategic thinking
- 9) Nature of war
- 10) Army building

Military History 2004

- 1) Mao on strategic decisions
- 2) National security in Chinese history
- 3) Experience national defense and Army building
- 4) Allied strategy in Ancient China
- 5) Historical review and practical considerations
- 6) Change in US policy towards Taiwan before and after the Korean War
- 7) Ancient thought on military management
- 8) Thalassocracy and the rise and fall of big powers (Maritime supremacy)

Academic/Book Review 2004

- 1) Protective engineering under conditions of informationized war
- 2) Sun Tzu's strategy of attacking alliances
- 3) Integrated systems of key target protection
- 4) Science of campaigns
- 5) Law of war guidance
- 6) Selected works of Sun Yu
- 7) Science and art of supporting military actions
- 8) Study of war theories
- 9) Virtual capitalist and neo-Imperialist war

China Military Science 2005
Information Warfare, Sun-Tzu, Stratagems, Japan

2005 takes on a curious mixture of information warfare, combined with the teaching of Sun-Tzu and stratagems. Media, psychological, and legal warfare are the tactical tools suggested to carry out this strategy of shaping the operational environment. Prevalent in the Chinese implementation of stratagems is the art of deception. Mr. Tim Thomas, a leading researcher on Chinese strategy, summed up stratagems as, "perhaps the most important science of strategy characteristic because deception is a practical expression of strategy." Mr. Thomas offered the following example:

"An important and revealing aspect of this mind-set is that the Chinese strive to impel opponents to follow a line of reasoning that they (the Chinese) craft. According to Li Bingyan, one of the most influential and brilliant contemporary Chinese strategists, they work to entice technologically superior opponents into unwittingly adopting a strategy that will lead to their defeat. Li's examples are noteworthy. First, he asks how an

inferior force could fight a technologically superior opponent. Using the example of a weak mouse (i.e., China) trying to keep track of a huge cat (i.e., the U.S.), he asks, ‘How could a mouse hang a bell around a cat’s neck?’ His answer: ‘The mouse cannot do this alone or with others. Therefore, the mouse must entice the cat to put the bell on himself.’”¹¹ For the first time since its mandate in 2000, the 2005 annual report to congress on *The Military Power of the People’s Republic of China* notes deception as a major theme in Chinese strategy.¹² In addition to deception, influence operations are also present in each of these categories of information, media, psychological, and legal.

- Developing issues: Information, psychological, and legal warfare combined with stratagems and *Art of War*

Subject Discussion 2005

- 1) National defense and Army scientific development outlook
- 2) 60th anniversary of victory of Chinese Anti-Japanese War
- 3) Theoretical study of combat spirits
- 4) War theory in the new century
- 5) Strategic thinking on military information construction
- 6) Theoretical study on military legal construction
- 7) Marxist military theory
- 8) Strategy of psychological warfare

Applied Study 2005

- 1) Coordinated development of national defense and economics
- 2) Military supply chains
- 3) Education training
- 4) Value of top military talent
- 5) Mobilization in regional information warfare
- 6) Army government and Army people relations
- 7) Information construction
- 8) Modernization
- 9) Strengthen capabilities in sci-tech and industry for national defense
- 10) Servicemen salary legislation
- 11) Training under informationized conditions
- 12) Training
- 13) Integrated firepower operations
- 14) Strategy of cultural efforts in media struggles

¹¹ Tim Thomas, “The Chinese Military’s Strategic Mindset,” *Military Review*, Nov-Dec 2007, as downloaded from <http://fmso.leavenworth.army.mil/documents/chinese-mind-set.pdf>

¹² *The Military Power of the People’s Republic of China 2005*, Department of Defense, 2005, as downloaded from <http://www.defense.gov/news/Jul2005/d20050719china.pdf>

Basic Study 2005

- 1) Military security
- 2) Military culture
- 3) Tactical reform
- 4) Sun Tzu and the *Art of War*
- 5) Bio-chemical weapons
- 6) Combat power
- 7) Military virtues
- 8) Psychological warfare
- 9) Culture
- 10) Military science
- 11) Informationization
- 12) Strategic thinking
- 13) Information era
- 14) Logistics
- 15) Informationized conditions and war complexity

Military History 2005

- 1) Compare *Art of War* and *Thirty-Six Stratagems*
- 2) Chen Yun's contributions to establishment of bases in Northeast China
- 3) Air domination failure of Chinese expeditionary force in Burma
- 4) Strategies of central Chinese dynasties
- 5) People's Liberation Army modernization and regulations in the early founding period
- 6) China's traditional strategy of defense
- 7) Historic changes in Chinese demobilization of servicemen
- 8) History of Northeast Anti-Japanese Army
- 9) Historical and cultural reasons for Japan's war of aggression

Academic/Book Review 2005

- 1) Analysis of thesis published in *China Military Science* over the past five years
- 2) Revolution in military affairs and military legal system
- 3) Informationization of Army political work
- 4) Application of Sun Tzu's *Art of War* in the information age
- 5) First military history
- 6) Memoirs of Liu Huaqing
- 7) Introduction to China's national defense

China Military Science 2006
Deception and Defense

Less focused on operational progression than in previous years, 2006 continues the themes of deception and influence; however, there is a renewed emphasis on

homeland security. This return to conventional defense may have been sparked by a number of incidents that occurred in 2006 from border disputes with India over Arunachal Pradesh¹³ to internal unrest which increased 6.6 percent in 2005.¹⁴

The *2006 Annual Report to Congress on Chinese military power* focuses attention on deception as a key strategy. The report acknowledges reliance on ancient stratagems but fails to define the specific areas, instead it merely makes an observation: “The writings of classical Chinese military figures Sun-Tzu, Sun Pin, Wu Ch’i, and Shang Yang all contain precepts on the use of deception by successful leaders and generals. In recent decades there has been resurgence in the study of ancient Chinese statecraft within the PLA. Whole departments of military academies teach moulüe, or strategic deception, derived from Chinese experience through the millennia. Authoritative contemporary doctrinal materials define the goals of strategic deception as “to lure the other side into developing misperceptions . . . and to [establish for oneself] a strategically advantageous position by producing various kinds of false phenomena in an organized and planned manner with the smallest cost in manpower and materials.”¹⁵

- Developing issues: Guide to national defense, defending Chinese sea rights, regional war, and frontier issues.

Subject Discussion 2006

- 1) Army modernization
- 2) Guide to national defense and Army development with scientific development concept
- 3) Study of geo-strategic theory
- 4) Guide to national defense and Army development with scientific development concept
- 5) Control of war
- 6) Strategy guide national reunification
- 7) Guide to national defense and Army development with scientific development concept

Applied Study 2006

- 1) Defending Chinese sea rights
- 2) Assessment and examination in choosing cadre
- 3) Constitutional law dealing with contingencies
- 4) Ideological and political work
- 5) Revolution in military affairs with Chinese characteristics

¹³ In 2006, the Chinese ambassador to India reasserted claims to a large section of north-eastern India. The Indian foreign minister claimed that China was occupying its territory in Kashmir. See *BBC News* “India and China Row Over Border”: http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia/6145866.stm

¹⁴ Kristin Jone, “China’s Hidden Unrest,” *Committee to Protect Journalist*, 1 May 2006, as downloaded from <http://cpj.org/reports/2006/05/china-06.php>

¹⁵ *The Military Power of the People’s Republic of China 2005*, Department of Defense, 2006, as downloaded from <http://www.dod.gov/pubs/pdfs/China%20Report%202006.pdf>

- 6) Building Navy grass roots
- 7) Military training in the new century
- 8) China security strategies
- 9) Military theory under information conditions
- 10) Political mobilization in the new situation
- 11) Mobilization of military finance

Basic Study 2006

- 1) Mao
- 2) Joint operations
- 3) Military science and system science
- 4) Information command system
- 5) Military theory
- 6) Party building
- 7) Military thinking comparing East and West
- 8) Marxist military theory
- 9) Mao's military thought
- 10) International law

Military History 2006

- 1) Chinese military academic history
- 2) Modern history of Chinese regional war
- 3) Modern history of Chinese doctrine on regional war
- 4) WWII battlefields: In China and the Pacific
- 5) Historical exploration of Chinese judicial power
- 6) Origin and development of Chinese Military thought
- 7) Anti-Japanese guerrilla warfare in the Northwest
- 8) Cultivating combat spirit in ancient Chinese armies
- 9) Development of PLA psychological warfare

Academic/Book Review 2006

- 1) Decisive factors of the results of war
- 2) Mao Zedong and the war to resist US aggression and aid Korea
- 3) Scientific development in national defense
- 4) Frontier issue on military thinking
- 5) Chronology of Su Yu
- 6) How to understand and judge the revolution in military affairs
- 7) On national security strategy
- 8) Military space aeronautics

China Military Science 2007 **Comprehensive**

2007 is comprehensive in nature and touches on all the major themes presented in previous years: defining Chinese military culture and seeking to bring nationalist sentiment inline with a party dominated army; peripheral defense focusing on maritime issues, Asia-Pacific security and borders; building an informationized force capable of operating in an information warfare environment; and economic construction for national defense.

Notably absent from this year's reporting was anything related to space-based development. This seems rather odd given the publication of *China's Space Activities in 2006* and the successful test of an anti-satellite missile that destroyed an inactive Chinese weather satellite in January of 2007.¹⁶ It is possible this indicates a lag time between writing and acceptance.

Subject Discussion 2007

- 1) Creative development of the party's theory of military guidance
- 2) Guide to national defense and Army scientific development
- 3) National defense and Army building in a harmonious society
- 4) Study of pre-practice theory of war
- 5) Strategic choices of rising of world powers
- 6) Create China military science system
- 7) Create China military science system: party guidance theory
- 8) Create China military science system: develop defense science and technology theory
- 9) Peace and development in China and Asia-Pacific security
- 10) History and reality of geo-strategy

Applied Study 2007

- 1) Military culture
- 2) Transformation in military training
- 3) Informationization
- 4) Integration of information technology and military science
- 5) China coastal defense strategy
- 6) Strategic capabilities
- 7) Military training under information conditions
- 8) Strategy of national science and technology
- 9) Optimal combination of man and weapon
- 10) Military training
- 11) Reform under scientific guidance concept
- 12) Unity of Army and party

¹⁶ "China's Space Activities in 2006," Information Office of the State Council of the People's Republic of China, Oct 2006, as downloaded from <http://www.china.org.cn/english/features/book/183672.htm>

- 13) Development of “Three Democracies” in the Army
- 14) Military training: Faster and Better
- 15) Scientific concept of sea rights
- 16) Training under information conditions
- 17) Military logistics problems under economic globalization

Basic Study 2007

- 1) Information warfare
- 2) Military diplomacy
- 3) Marxist view of war
- 4) Social functions of war
- 5) Economic construction and national defense
- 6) Strategy
- 7) Mao
- 8) Values of contemporary servicemen
- 9) Information age
- 10) Marx, Engels, and Clausewitz
- 11) Army development
- 12) Sea security theory
- 13) Soft power
- 14) Information warfare
- 15) Logistics

Military History 2007

- 1) Confucian hegemony thinking of pre-Qin Dynasty
- 2) Analysis of national security strategy throughout ancient Chinese dynasties
- 3) Historical experiences of the People’s Liberation Army Air Force
- 4) Historical experiences of border defense of Northwest China
- 5) Pre-Qin and Han Dynasty security choices
- 6) Japan’s two-rises and strategic choices
- 7) Ancient dynasties maintaining national security
- 8) National security strategies from an island state of Europe

Academic/Book Review 2007

- 1) Transformation in military training
- 2) Selected works of Su Yu
- 3) Biography of Song Shilun
- 4) Military law construction
- 5) Essay presented at 2005 doctrinal forum of China military

China Military Science 2008

Military Operations Other Than War, Non-War, Non-Contact, Non-Traditional

Not easily defined, non-war operations include everything from peacekeeping missions to cyber attacks, depending on the military branch in question. What is apparent is that the Chinese are seeking to define a doctrine outside the traditional boundaries of conventional operations. In the new global environment, large-scale, military-on-military confrontation is to be avoided and a different methodology established in order to further national interests.

Subject Discussion 2008

- 1) Create a military science system
- 2) Study of strategic culture of China and other nations
- 3) Construction and operations of soft power
- 4) Non-war military operations
- 5) Advance development of military training
- 6) Operations under information conditions
- 7) Development of military guidance theory

Applied Study 2008

- 1) Military science, operational theory of ground forces and informationization
- 2) Military legal work
- 3) High ranking commanders joint operations
- 4) Following party leadership
- 5) National defense mobilization
- 6) Military space power
- 7) Military talent in science and technology
- 8) Information operations command
- 9) Mobilization of the national economy
- 10) Military talent groups
- 11) Non-war military operations
- 12) Development of military talents
- 13) Civil-Military integrated support

Basic Study 2008

- 1) Marxist military theory
- 2) Economics and national defense
- 3) Political work
- 4) Information law
- 5) Military history
- 6) Mao
- 7) Military reform
- 8) Informationization

- 9) War violence
- 10) Lenin
- 11) Non-traditional security
- 12) Law management of the Army

Military History 2008

- 1) Causes that split and unite in Chinese history
- 2) Mao: Containing war and maintaining peace
- 3) Historical experience and insights of political work in major transitions after the founding of New China
- 4) Culture in the *Art of War*
- 5) Rise and fall of world powers: Development of Economy and National Defense
- 6) Factors that affect ancient Chinese martial spirit
- 7) Military theoretic system 1912-1949
- 8) Historical insights into military reform
- 9) Song Dynasty: Avoiding war by seeking peace
- 10) Song Shenzong's strategy in the battles of Hehuang and Xihe
- 11) Qing Dynasty: Army building

Academic/Book Review 2008

- 1) Selected military works of Liu Huaping
- 2) Analysis of ancient security strategies
- 3) China military academic history
- 4) A new interpretation of Sun Tzu's *Art of War*
- 5) Challenges that face Marxist war outlook
- 6) Weak defeating strong under information conditions
- 7) Statistics and analysis of essays in China Military Science from 1998-2007

The following two tables list the number of times a subject was mentioned in each of the years from 2002-2008. As mentioned previously, determining the specific category an article belonged was not always readily apparent. Depending on the emphasis, or lack thereof, several articles could be placed in different fields.

	Information- ization/ Information Warfare	Sun Tzu	Culture	Maritime Border Air Defense	Legal/ Psychological Warfare	Logistics	Space	Future Warfare/ Non- traditional
2002	4	0	4	2	5	1	1	2
2003	6	2	1	2	2	3	2	0
2004	4	2	1	0	2	1	0	5
2005	7	3	3	1	4	2	0	2
2006	2	0	0	4	4	0	1	0
2007	7	0	1	3	2	2	0	1
2008	4	2	0	0	3	0	1	5

	Marxist Theory	Strategy	Mobilization	War Theory	Taiwan Japan	Mao Deng	Economics	Geo-Strategy
2002	2	3	0	1	2	0	0	2
2003	2	6	2	5	0	2	4	2
2004	1	2	1	8	1	4	0	1
2005	1	1	0	0	3	0	1	0
2006	1	2	1	3	1	3	0	1
2007	2	3	0	2	0	1	1	2
2008	2	2	1	2	0	2	3	0

Other names of interest featured in *China Military Science*:

Year	Figure
2002	Engels
	Liu Yalou
	Su Yu
	Cai E
2004	Su Yu
2005	Chen Yun
	Liu Huaqing
2006	Su Yu
2007	Engels
	Clausewitz
	Su Yu
	Song Shilun
2008	Song Shengzong
	Lenin
	Song Shengzong

d. Statistics for the Group of Core Authors

The research team from China's Academy of Military Science noted that core authors were generally identified by the number and quality of articles published over a given period of time, in this case ten years. Realizing the speculative nature of trying to quantify quality, the team decided to ignore this factor and stick with the number of articles produced as their sole basis for classifying an individual as a core author. Only those writers who had produced at least five articles in the ten-year period were identified as core authors. Those not meeting the criteria of a primary author only produced on average 1.3 essays, while core authors generated 6.8.¹⁷

¹⁷ Luo Jiancheng, Zheng Yi, Chen Haoliang, "Statistics and Analysis of the Essays in *China Military Science* (1998-2007)," *China Military Science* No. 1, 2008, p. 149-156

From the perspective of researchers who study Chinese military strategy and theory, the list of core authors presents a different way to analyze trends in security. It would be expected that core authors, in one of China's most respected publications, would have a disproportional influence on the direction and development of Chinese doctrine. Following the career paths of these writers gives us an opportunity to view their influence outside of *China Military Science*. For example, two of the top core authors, Yao Youzhi and Peng Guangqian, were editors for The Science of Military Strategy. Xia Zhengnan has written extensively on Mao, Sun-Tzu, and Deng Xiaoping. Li Jijun, a Lieutenant General in the People's Liberation Army, has written a book titled, Traditional Military Thinking and the Defensive Strategy of China. Wang Baocun is considered one of the China's preeminent writers on information and cyber warfare.

Table 4: Statistics for the Group of Core Authors

name	essay distribution over the years										total
	1997	1998	1999	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	
Yao Youzhi	1	1	3	1	4	1	3	2	3		19
Xia Zhengnan	1	1	1	1	1		2	3	1	1	12
Peng Guangqian		2	1	2	3		3				11
Liu Jixian	1	1	1	1	1		2	1	1	1	10
Tang Fuquan	1			1	2	1	1	1	2	1	10
Huang Pumin	1	1	2	1	1	2	1				9
Li Jijun	2	1	2	1	1			1		1	9
Dai Yifang	2	3	1	1	1						8
Huang Yingxu	1	1	2	1		2			1		8
Ren Li	1		1	1	1	1	1		1	1	8
Wang Baocun	1		1	2	2	2					8
Chen Zhou		1		1		2	1	1	1		7
Cong Wensheng		1		1	1			1	2	1	7
Wen Zongren		1		1	2	1	1	1			7
Chang Wanquan						1	1	1	2	1	6
Fang Yonggang			1			1	1	1	1	1	6
Gao Jianguo			1	1	1		1		1	1	6
Gong Gucheng	1		1	1	1		2				6

Huang Jinsheng				1	2	2		1			6
Mi Zhenyu		1	1		2			1		1	6
Tan Yiqing		2	1	1	1		1				6
Wu Rusong	1	1			1			3			6
Zhang Shude				1		1	1	1	1	1	6
Ge Dongsheng								1	3	1	5
Hao Wanlu		1		1	1	1		1			5
Kang Hengzheng					1	2	2				5
Liu Qing	2	1		1		1					5
Peng Huaidong	1	2					1			1	5
Sun Jianmin				1		2				2	5
Wang Jianmin	1						1	1	1	1	5
Wang Pufeng	1					1	1	2			5
Wang Zhen						1	1		2	1	5
Wang Zhenxing				1	1	2		1			5
Wang Zhiping		1		1	1			2			5
Yan Gaohong			1			1	1	2			5
Yu Rubo	1				1	1		1		1	5
Yu Zhengshan		1	1	1	1	1					5
Yuan Dejin		1				1	1	1		1	5
Zhang Wei	1	1	1	1				1			5
Zhu Xiaoli				1		1	1	1		1	5

e. Statistics for the Unit Distribution of the Authors

The survey assigned the total number of contributing authors into 21 categories based on unit affiliation. The categories were spread out over major command elements (125 authors), service specific (52 authors), military academic institutions and schools (1,167 authors), the seven military regions (153 authors), civilian units (58 authors), and unidentified elements (30 authors). Of the 1,585 individual authors, nearly 2/3 of the contributors came from military academic and school institutions:¹⁸

74% Military academic and school institutions

26% Seven military regions
 Major command elements
 Civilian units
 Service specific
 Unidentified elements

¹⁸ Ibid

Table 5: Statistics for the Unit Distribution of the Authors

unit	Central Military Commission	General Staff Department	General Political Department	General Logistics Department	General Armament Department	Navy
number	9	41	36	16	23	17
unit	Air Force	Second Artillery	Armed Police	Academy of Military Science	National Defense University	Shenyang Military Region
number	12	9	14	500	100	23
unit	Beijing Military Region	Jinan Military Region	Nanjing Military Region	Guangzhou Military Region	Lanzhou Military Region	Chengdu Military Region
number	18	16	20	37	23	16
unit	other institutions and schools	civilian units	uncertain units			
number	567	58	30			

f. Statistics for the Military Ranks of the Authors

In order to address the question of quality, China Academy researchers created a table of the author's military ranks with the premise that military rank reflects experience and knowledge. They were unable to compile a complete list of all author's ranks due to insufficient biographical data in their historic records. Of the 1,065 authors where biographical data was available, 375 were major general or above, accounting for 35%; 638 field grade officers, accounting for 60%; and 52 junior officers accounting for 4.9%.¹⁹

Table 6: Statistics for the Authors' Ranks

rank	general	lieutenant	major	senior	colonel	lieutenant	major
		general	general	colonel		colonel	
number	34	114	227	367	122	99	50
rank	captain	first lieutenant	second lieutenant	total			
number	41	11	0	1065			

g. Statistics for the Authors' Special Technical Duties

Limited biographical data once again hampered full statistical reporting on the authors' special technical duties. The survey was only able to tally 51.5% of the total number of authors in this table. According to the Chinese, special technical duties, which we might refer to as academic background, conveyed a greater sense of the authors' experience and academic achievement.

¹⁹ Ibid

Table 7: Statistics for the Authors' Special Technical Duties

duty	number
researcher	235
professor	215
research librarian	2
senior engineer	7
editor	7
assistant researcher	94
assistant research librarian	1
assistant professor	139
assistant editor	5
lecturer	61
research aid	43
professor's aid	3
total	812

IV. Analysis and Evaluation

As with the statistics compiled on topic distribution, the Chinese analysis and conclusions were focused on the bibliometric survey as related to *China Military Science* and not for the purpose of examining content. For this reason, much of their analysis was discarded; however, their critique of the publication did provide interesting insights. The Chinese team felt that too many of the authors came from the academic world and should be balanced with writers from the individual services. Only 13% of the authors came from the Army, Navy, or Air Force. It was also pointed out that there were a disproportionate number of middle and senior experts, with over 87% of the contributors having upper-level academic achievement. The criticism being that there was a disproportionate number of senior-level officers. Similarly, it was suggested that the publication increase the number of authors from civilian units and invite foreign military experts to publish on hot topics. Rounding out their critique, the Chinese team suggested creating an online version and an English edition.

Conclusions

In the beginning, this paper sought to answer four key questions about the journal *China Military Science*. 1.) Can it be used as a source to track trends in Chinese military strategy and theory? 2.) Is it a historic journal that focuses on lessons learned and reviews past campaigns? 3.) Does it function as a contemporary journal noting current events and developments? 4.) Can *China Military Science* be used to predict what the People's Liberation Army will do in the future? The answer to all of these questions is yes; the journal ties past, present, and future strategies into a blueprint for the next generation of developments and it is a source that appears to track trends in strategy and theory.

In order to follow the trends contained in *China Military Science*, it is important to understand the overall context in which they take place. The almost frantic impetus placed on modernization would be lost without background on Chinese reactions to the Gulf War, Afghanistan, and Iraq. We might never be able to explain what prompts the People's Liberation Army to expend so much energy on building its military culture if we failed to see the conflict between nationalism and party. The journal is not merely a random collection of academic works in military affairs; it is a deliberate selection of pertinent articles related to China's military ambitions and present day context.

The narrative forms easily after examining individual years and then thinking of them collectively. Complacent for many years with a mass army whose sheer size alone was a deterrent to most nations, the Chinese were forced to abandon this false sense of security following the revelations of the Gulf War. The advent of precision weapons and standoff operations convinced People's Liberation Army leadership that only a modernized army was capable of withstanding the conditions of a high-tech battlefield. Having made that decision, the next question was how to proceed? Modernization is not solved by simply purchasing equipment; it requires a myriad of adjustments in strategy, force composition, and organization.

Strategy would be the primary driver that affects all other decisions on the road to transformation. The idea of matching the US plane for plane and tank for tank had been discarded years ago. Beijing had witnessed the arms race between the US and the old Soviet Union and it would not be drawn into a new one. Certainly antiquated equipment would need to be replaced or upgraded, but where to go from there if parity in military hardware is not your goal? The answer may have come from Mao himself who once said, "You fight your war and I'll fight mine." The Chinese military is challenging conventional wisdom and moving warfare in a different direction using deception and influence operations such as cyber, media, psychological, economic, and legal warfare. If not new forms of war, they will at least be effective tools in shaping the operational environment in the event of a conventional conflict. The means of implementing this new strategy rely on a mixture of Sun-Tzu, stratagems, and lessons from past Chinese military leaders.

With strategic options under consideration, military leaders would have had to ask if the current military structure was appropriate and if the personnel were suitably adequate to handle this new approach. In the past, the People's Liberation Army used frontal assault and envelopment as their primary forms of engagement. Neither requires a highly educated soldier and the equipment needed is relatively cheap and simple to operate. Employment of high-tech hardware and systems can take years to master and they are expensive. These factors forced the People's Liberation Army to make massive cuts in numbers, while at the same time enticing younger and better educated recruits to make the military a career. This is proving difficult as the standard of living increases for the urban population, who are the best educated and tend to seek civilian jobs that offer higher salaries. While many of China's youth are nationalist, this does not naturally translate into Communist Party supporters. Changing the military culture to incorporate educated younger soldiers is a difficult balance and will be a challenge for many years to come.

Issues of sovereignty and peripheral defense have both practical and psychological foundations for China. Beijing is extremely sensitive to any form of encroachment on its territory and there is a national memory of a time when it was divided by Western powers. China's global position is often overlooked as a source of national anxiety and as a driver for defense initiatives. Surrounded by eighteen different countries, all with different languages and culture, presents a formidable dilemma in creating a comprehensive and coherent defense strategy. From the articles contained in *China Military Science* that dealt with peripheral defense, maritime security is the most pressing problem, followed closely by border defense. Access denial has, and will be an ongoing strategy. As perhaps a hybrid strategy for a new war form and an additional border defense issue, space-based operations have gradually crept into Chinese thinking. The destruction of their own weather satellite was undoubtedly sent as a message of defense capabilities, it must also be seen as a new offensive potential.

The year 2008 offers us another look at the transformation in Chinese military affairs with the introduction of topics such as military operations other than war, non-war, non-contact war, and non-traditional warfare. Not all of these terms are synonymous with one another and should not be confused. Military operations other than war and non-war are similar as they have both been used to describe peacekeeping operations. Non-contact war would encompass missile strikes and non-traditional warfare could be anything from cyber to economic attacks. While these are not new ideas or theories, it perhaps suggests an effort to incorporate them into a more comprehensive strategy. For example, peacekeeping operations carried out in other parts of the world could easily be combined with information, media, psychological, or legal operations. The introduction of these topics also shows that the Chinese military is moving farther away from its roots as a mass army designed for national defense to one with global initiatives.

Had we closely monitored *China Military Science* and other domestically produced periodicals, it would not have taken until 2008 for the *Annual Report to*

Congress Military Power of the People's Republic of China to finally link the definitions of the most prominent strategies being debated in mainland China:

1) **Psychological Warfare**: the use of propaganda, deception, threats, and coercion to affect the enemy's ability to understand and make decisions.

2) **Media Warfare**: the dissemination of information to influence public opinion and gain support from domestic and international audiences for China's military actions.

3) **Legal Warfare**: the use of international and domestic laws to gain international support and manage possible political repercussions of China's military actions.

We would have been able to detect them at least three years prior, if not sooner. Even though the annual report to congress was able to define the strategies, it had very little insight into how they were being implemented. We have yet to see economic warfare linked to these strategies in any meaningful way. While the US military does have experience with psychological and media warfare, the Chinese are likely to create forms we have not encountered before. Legal and economic warfare are of even greater concern and two areas we have very little experience.